| **Student Name:** Jodie Li |
| --- |

| **Motion:** This house believes that developing countries have a "right to pollute" the environment |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 71.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| **Teacher comments:**  [NOTE: Today’s speeches are 8 minutes’ long.]  Good hook emphasising on the innate inequality of the status quo.  On the set-up:   * Good characterisation on the right to pollute should be exempt from punishments and retaliation from polluting. * Rather than completely remove every expectation, we should emphasise that developed nations have to bear the burden of the green transition, then engage in things like technology sharing so that they may transition in the future. * All of the analysis on the incentives of developing countries to make the green transition in the future should all be in the argument instead!   + Good reasoning, but the political will angle is not nuanced to the desires of the burgeoning working class. * While the burden isn’t wrong, it’s easy for Opp to flip that the most vulnerable would rightly be the future victims of the climate crisis.   On the first argument:   * Well done characterising the role played by developed nations in contributing to the climate crisis.   + We should expand and explain that the majority of polluting companies are actually companies belonging to developed nations, who simply establish their supply chains abroad and pollute in developing nations. * After expounding on colonialism and the role that played in trapping the economy of developing nations, we can relate this back to justifying reparations, and why developed nations ought to shoulder the present burden of the green transition. * The moral parallel on racial discrimination sounds very far-fetched! But I appreciate the intention behind attempting the rhetoric. * When we explained that these countries bear the brunt of environmental collapse, wouldn’t it make more sense that they would also be engaging in the prevention of said collapse? Surely, proximate pollution plays a great role in the causation of that harm. * We need to link all of the above to your principle justification!   On your second argument:   * Good analysis on not having the resources to commit to the green transition. * It isn’t clear why the opportunity cost had to be healthcare systems, why can’t it be drawn from the investments put into manufacturing.   + We need more mechanistic analysis why these developing nations only have comparative advantage in the manufacturing industry, thus will have little to no alternative economic plan.     - If Opp showcases ANY viable alternatives, then all of your harms no longer materialise. * We need to be more comparative and explain why there is still time for these developing nations to catch up to the green transition after taking their time to accumulate their wealth first.   Good job offering POIs today!  8.13 - Good timing. | | | | | | |